

Expressions of Quotativity and Reportivity

German Reported Speech and Reportive
Evidentiality

Jeroen Vanderbiesen

University of Antwerp, Research Foundation - Flanders (FWO)

- A. Theoretical Background
 - A.1. Reportive Evidentiality vs. Reported Speech
 - A.2. Reportivity and Quotativity
- B. Data Analysis: *sollen* ('shall')
- C. Final Thoughts

A. Theoretical Background

A.1. Reportive Evidentiality vs. Reported Speech

A.1. REvi vs. RS

- (Reportive) Evidentiality
 - "Evidentiality proper is understood as **stating the existence of a source of evidence for some information**; this includes stating that there is some evidence, and also specifying what type of evidence there is" (Aikhenvald 2003: 1)
 - For REvi: "indicating that the current speaker has not witnessed the event him/herself but has merely heard about it from other sources" (Chojnicka 2012: 173)
- Reported Speech
 - 173: "brings together **tools and devices used for attributing knowledge to another speaker**[,] usually divided into direct and indirect speech, which differs in the degree to which the original speaker's perspective – or voice – is preserved"

Commonalities

- 1. Both involve reference/referral
 - **Information** in a certain (syntactic, prosodic,...) **form** (or register) with a certain (semantic) **content**, occurring with a certain **purpose** in a certain **situation** (place, time), stemming from one or more **sources** (persons) in a certain **interaction**
 - **Referenced** by **another person** (typically the current speaker) with a certain purpose in another (similar or different syntactic, prosodic,...) form with roughly the same (semantic) content in another situation and interaction

A.1. REvi vs. RS

- 2. Both crucially invoke 'source'
 - A **Referred SP/W** or **Information Source**
 - The (supposed) origin of the information that is rendered in the/ as the proposition
 - Variety of ways of marking (see infra)
 - A **Referring SP/W**
 - Renders information in the proposition while (overtly) referring back to its origin (thus signalling his own non-authorship)
 - Often not marked overtly

=> Clearly related, yet also clearly different

Differences

- 1. Different kinds of reference/referral
 - Reported Speech
 - References a SOURCE/ SP/W (and the info it provided)
 - Renders **utterances of others**
 - Jakobson (1971: 130), Chojnicka (2012: 173, 175): *knowledge attribution to another speaker*, Güldemann (2008: 407): *"In normal R[eported] D[iscourse] the quote [...] represents non-immediate discourse; [a] minor part of a larger text that constitutes the immediate discourse", "the quote [...] is a fairly well-delineated intrusion into the main text"*
 - Marking in German
 - Two propositions (speech act + content of speech act)
 - Pres Subj, Ind (+ source indication) ,
quotation marks, verbs of **saying**, INF, ...)

A.1. REvi vs. RS⁸

- Reportive Evidentiality
 - References **some type of information**
 - Indicates **sources for one's own utterances**, focus on **SELF**
 - Güldemann (2008: 407): *"With a hearsay evidential [...] the text in the scope of the evidential [...] belongs to the main body of the ongoing immediate discourse", "the quote [...] "expands" to actually become the main text"*
 - Chojnicka (2012: 175): *speaker claim is central, evidence is "background information"*
 - Marking in German
 - One proposition (content of speech act)
 - *sollen* 'shall' (*wollen* 'will'), potentially things like *es heißt* 'it is said'

A.1. REvi vs. RS⁹

- 2. Different source relevance (and type/marking, see *infra*)
 - Reported Speech
 - Focus on the Referred SP/W
 - The Referring SP/W enters into his own discourse a swath of text that is perspectivised from the Referred SP/W
 - Reportive Evidentiality
 - Focus on the Referring SP/W
 - The Referring SP/W makes a swath of text that does not stem from him to part of his own discourse, rendered from his own perspective

A.2. Reportivity and Quotativity

A.2. Reportivity and Quotativity

- RS and REvi invoke the same (facets of the same) domain, but differently
- Can be related as poles on a continuum within that domain
- Diewald & Smirnova (2010):
 - RS = Quotatives (non-deictic)
 - Speaker role shifts to a 2nd speaker who is quoted
 - One comm. sit. embedded in another (2 mental spaces)
 - Current "I-Here-Now" ≠ vantage point
 - REvi = Reportives (deictic)
 - Speaker role remains with 1st speaker
 - Source marked in current comm. sit. (1 mental space)
 - Current "I-Here-Now" = vantage point



A.2. Reportivity and Quotativity

- However, a continuum implies "intermediate constructions", gradual transitions from pole to pole
- Hence: Quotativity and Reportivity
 - A degree of the measure to which a construction is quotative or reportive in nature
 - Check lists can be made of the traits the most prototypical (or rather basic) representative of each category has
 - Intermediate constructions will share traits of both categories

A.2. Reportivity and Quotativity

- Quotatives = Quotes (Prototypically:)

Meir Lau [...] **sagte** vor kurzem im israelischen Radio den Satz: “[...] **Ich** habe diese Erfahrung in **meiner** Kindheit nicht gemacht” (DS/37.12/32)

‘Meir Lau recently spoke the following sentence on Israeli radio: “I did not have this experience in my childhood” ‘

- “**channelling**” or “**mediating**” another perspective; communicative distancing (Confais 1989: deactualisation)
- “**Accuracy Requirement**”
- RefInfo= finite clause, grounded in **surrogate ground**
- Clear delineation of what is (not) referred (cf. **two propositions**)
- Clear overt indication of **def, sg, human source**
- Description of **source, speech act/situation, register, interaction, content, form**
- **Non-deictic** marking (speech verbs, quotation marks...)

A.2. Reportivity and Quotativity

- Reportives = Reports (Prototypically:)

Rund die Hälfte der Gefangenen stammt aus Jemen; auch der Verstorbene **soll** Jemenit **gewesen sein** (FAZ/12-09/6)

'Around half of the inmates comes from Yemen; the deceased is also said to have been a Yemenite'

- Information from **own perspective** – communicative imposing (still indicating non-authorship)
- **No "Accuracy Requirement"**
- Referred info ("essential content", cf. Langacker 1987b: 253) = **non-finite**
- Referred info is part of **one proposition**, grounded in the **actual ground**
- **Source "restrictionless"**, often not marked overtly and/or unknown
- Characterisation of **content**, vague reference to **third-party source**
- **Deictic marking** ((mood), modal verbs)

A.2. Reportivity and Quotativity

- “Traditional” continua: type approach
 - E.g. Vliegen (2010): between types of RS
 - $DR > DRp > IRp > nIR > DASS > INF$
 - Mortelmans & Vanderbiesen (2011): between moods/modals
 - *sollen* > *wollen* > present subjunctive
- Refinement: token approach
 - E.g. One DR token may have more reportive traits than another
 - Illustrated with *sollen*

B. Data Analysis: *sollen* 'shall'

B. Data Analysis: *sollen*

- Manually composed German newspaper corpus
 - Tabloid: *Bild*
 - Broadsheet: *Frankfurter Allgemeine Zeitung, der Spiegel*
 - Regional: *Münchner Merkur, Frankfurter Neue Presse*
- One edition each (12/09/2012)
 - Scanned for RS (and limiting cases), relevant *sollen*- and *wollen*-constructions (and ambiguous cases)
- So far: 97 tokens for *sollen*

B. Data Analysis: *sollen*

- *Sollen*: very reportive

- Mitarbeiter von führenden deutschen Stahlherstellern **sollen sich** [...] auf Firmenkosten im Bordell **vergnügt haben**. (B/12-09/6)
'Coworkers of leading German steel producers are said to have enjoyed themselves in brothels on the company's dime'
- Der Militärische Abschirmdienst der Bundeswehr (MAD) **soll** [...] **versucht haben** [...] Uwe Mundlos anzuwerben. Das wurde gestern beim Untersuchungsausschuss im Bundestag bekannt. (B/12-09/2)
'The Military Counterintelligence Service is said to have attempted to hire Uwe Mundlos. That came out yesterday in the committee of inquiry in parliament'

- Tokens may appear with quotative elements

B. Data Analysis: *sollen*

Overt source indication

- Nach ersten Erkenntnissen der Polizei **soll** der Fahrer in letzter Sekunde **versucht haben**, eine Autobahnausfahrt zu nehmen. (FAZ/12-09/9)
'According to preliminary observations by police the driver is said to have attempted to take an exit at the last second'
- Laut Augenzeugen **sollen** die Schüler kurz zuvor an der Laterne darüber **gescherzt haben**, dass bei Berührung Funken aus ihr sprühten. (B/12-09/3)
'According to eyewitnesses, the students are said to immediately beforehand have made light of the fact that upon touching it the lighting pole was spraying sparks'

B. Data Analysis: *sollen*

Co-occurrence with quotations

- Seine Behörde **soll sich** nach Angaben Edathys sogar zu der Bemerkung **hinreißen haben lassen**, es handele sich „nur um einen Mordfall“, dies sei nicht „wichtig genug, dass [die] Polizei helfen muss“. (FAZ/12-09/4)
'According to indications by Edathy his public authority is said to have even been coaxed into making the remark that they were dealing "with only a murder case", it was not "important enough that the police should help" '
- Am häufigsten **sollen** Ärzte bei Operationen **"geschludert und gepfuscht" haben**. (MM/12-09/17)
'Most frequently, doctors are said to have "blundered and bungled" during operations'

B. Data Analysis: *sollen*

Occurrence in/support from RS-constructions

- „Das Tafelsilber wird verscherbelt“, **soll** Dehm unter anderem **gesagt haben** – was er bestreitet. (FNP/12-09/11)
' "The silverware is being broken", Dehm alledgedly said, amongst other things – which he contests'
- Laut „Bild“-Zeitung **soll** Amann auch zwei weiteren Führungskräften **mitgeteilt haben**, dass er nicht weiter mit ihnen zusammenarbeiten wolle. (BMP/12-09/10)
'According to "Bild"-Zeitung, Amann is said to have told two other executives that he did not want to continue working with them'

C. Final Thoughts

C. Final Thoughts

- RS and REvi on a continuum
 - Proto RS is quotative: info is ascribed to a specific source and presented from its perspective
 - Proto REvi is reportive: info is marked as being non-original (reported) to the current SP/W, as having another source
 - In actual practice, constructions often do a bit of both
- Amazing flexibility
 - *Variatio delectat*
 - Clear boundary between reportives and quotatives as types, but fuzzy between their tokens: reportivity and quotativity
 - Not “anything goes” (e.g. no reportive DR or quotative *sollen* (!)), but definite tendencies and overlaps, which is desirable from a cognitive linguistic perspective

C. Final Thoughts

- Continuum goes both ways
 - Quotatives may grammaticalise into reportives, but not vice versa
 - But we see reportives may take up quotative functions and traits (and vice versa)
- Function is crucial
 - Traditional research defines types of RS on syntactic (i.e. formal) grounds
 - Token approach looks at function first: not the type of marker defines the classification as RS or REvi / reportive or quotative, but the function of the token in context
 - This involves looking not only at content, but also at construal
 - Source is a critical ingredient

C. Final Thoughts

- Further Research
 - Reported Speech constructions (more compelling data)
 - *Wollen* (hybrid form)
 - Theoretical implications of continuum (“reportive mood” in German)
 - Relation to epistemic and other non-evidential uses
 - Detailed study of source-marking (main clause vs. adverbial phrase,...)

***It is said that these talks
have to leave time for
questions...***

So have at it!

jeroen.vanderbiesen@ua.ac.be