Recommendations for Navigating Moral Distress

The results of a scoping review

Sadie Deschenes, Kaitlyn Tate, Shannon D. Scott, Diane Kunyk

Faculty of Nursing, University of Alberta

How We Will Spend Our Time Together

- Background
- Brief overview of my doctoral
- Aim
- Methods
- Results
- Key findings

Background

Knowledge Gap

- Limited approaches to prepare nurses for morally distressing situations
- Limited comprehensive literature reviews on MD

Objective of my Doctoral Research

- To develop an intervention to mitigate the negative effects of MD for PICU/PCICU nurses

Phases of Research

Scoping Review Aim

Methods

- Levac, Colquhoun, and O'Brien's (2010) methodological framework
- Mixed Methods Appraisal Tool (Hong et al., 2018)
- PRISMA guidelines

Methods

- Inclusion criteria
  1) interventional studies on moral distress
  2) participants were nurses working directly with patients or participants included nurses and a sub–analysis by professional group/role was conducted, and
  3) moral distress was clearly defined by the researchers, and the definition included the main components of moral distress.

Results

4043 Abstracts screened

554 Reviewed in full

10 Articles included

Included Studies

- Published between 2008–2020
- Study design
  - 4 before–after studies
  - 3 randomized control trials
  - 2 concurrent mixed–methods studies
  - 1 controlled before–after study
- All studies were conducted in acute care settings

Types of Interventions

- Moral distress awareness and information
- Nurses' workplace reflexivity
- Interprofessional rounds
- Policy change
- Multicomponent intervention

Types of Interventions

- Moral distress awareness and information (n=4)
  - Beumer, 2008. Single 2–hour session
  - Molazem et al., 2013. 2, 4–hour sessions
  - Abbasi et al., 2019. 2, 6–hour sessions
  - Bevan and Emerson, 2020. 3, 4–hour sessions

Types of Interventions

- Nurses' workplace reflexivity (n=2)
  - Meziane et al., 2018. 3 sessions each lasting between 45–75 minutes
  - Saeedi, et al., 2019. Once a week for 8 weeks
- Interprofessional rounds (n=1)
  - Wocial et al., 2017. Weekly rounds for 12 months.

Types of Interventions

- Policy change (n=1)
  - Bosshardt et al., 2018.
- Multicomponent intervention (n=2)
  - Bruce and Allen, 2020.
  - Vaclavik, et al., 2018

Additional Intervention Details

- Intervention Providers
- Intervention Recipients
- Intervention Measurement Tools
- Level of Intervention
- Quality appraisal

Intervention Outcomes

- 3 studies reported statistically significant decrease in overall moral distress scores
- 3 studies noted a difference in specific survey items
- 3 studies found no statistically significant results
- 1 study was unclear whether results were statistically significant or not

Recommendations from Included Studies

Key Findings

- There is no clear pattern regarding which strategies best minimize the effects of moral distress among nurses
- Future interventions should be tested more broadly
- Standardized findings from the MDS–R

Questions

Thank You

References:

Abbasi, S., Ghafari, S., Shahriari, M., & Shahgholian, N. (2019). Effect of moral empowerment program on moral distress in intensive care unit nurses. *Nursing Ethics*, *26*(5), 1494–1504. https://doi.org/10.1177/0969733018766576

Arksey, H., & O'Malley, L. (2005). Scoping studies: Towards a methodological framework. *International Journal of Social Research Methodology, 8*(1), 19–32. https://doi.org/10.1080/1364557032000119616

Ataby, G., Çangarli, B., & Penbek, S. (2015). Impact of ethical climate on moral distress revisited: Multidimensional view. *Nursing Ethics,* 22(1), 103–116. https://doi.org/10.1177/0969733014542674American Association of Critical-Care Nurses. (2005). The 4 A's to rise above moral distress. *Aliso Viejo, CA: American Association of Critical-Care Nurses*.

Austin, W. (2012). Moral distress and the contemporary plight of health professionals. *HEC Forum, 24*(1), 27–38. https://doi.org/10.1007/s10730-012-9179-8

Austin, W. (2016). Contemporary healthcare practice and the risk of moral distress. *Healthcare Management Forum*, 29(3), 131–133. https://doi.org/10.1177%2F0840470416637835

Austin, W., Bergum, V., & Goldberg, L. (2003). Unable to answer the call of our patients: Mental health nurses' experience of moral distress. *Nursing Inquiry, 10*(3), 177–183.

Austin, W., Lemermeyer, G., Goldberg, L., Bergum, V., & Johnson, M. (2005). Moral distress in healthcare practice: The situation of nurses. *HEC Forum,* 17(1), 33–48. https://doi.org/10.1007/s10730-00504949-1

Austin, W., Rankel, M., Kagan, L., Bergum, V., & Lemermeyer, G. (2005). To stay or to go, to speak or stay silent, to act or not to act: Moral distress as experienced by psychologists. *Ethics & Behavior, 15*(3), 197–212.

Austin, C. L., Saylor, R., & Finley, P. J. (2017). Moral distress in physicians and nurses: Impact on professional quality of life and turnover. *Psychological Trauma: Theory, Research, Practice, and Policy*, *9*(4), 399. http://dx.doi.org/10.1037/tra0000201

Bell, J., & Breslin, J. M. (2008). Healthcare provider moral distress as a leadership challenge. *JONA's Healthcare Law, Ethics & Regulation, 10*(4), 94–99.

Beumer, C. M. (2008). Innovative solutions: The effect of a workshop on reducing the experience of moral distress in an intensive care unit setting. *Dimensions of Critical Care Nursing, 27*(6), 263–267.

Bevan, N. A., & Emerson, A. M. (2020). Freirean conscientization with critical care nurses to reduce moral distress and increase perceived empowerment: A pilot study. *Advances in Nursing Science*, *43*(3), E131–E146.

Bong, H. E. (2019). Understanding moral distress: How to decrease turnover rates of new graduate pediatric nurses. *Pediatric Nursing, 45*(3), 109–114.

Bruce, S. D., & Allen, D. (2020). Moral Distress: One unit's recognition and mitigation of this problem. *Clinical Journal of Oncology Nursing*, *24*(1), 16–18. https://doi.org/10.1188/20.CJON.16-18

Bosshardt, M. H., Coyne, P. J., Marsden, J., Su, Z., & Melvin, C. L. (2018). Palliative care consultation policy change and its effect on nurses' moral distress in an academic medical center. *Journal of Hospice & Palliative Nursing*, *20*(4), 325–329. https://doi.org/10.1097/NJH.0000000000000456

Burston, A. S., & Tuckett, A. G. (2013). Moral distress in nursing: Contributing factors, outcomes and interventions. *Nursing Ethics, 20*(3), 312–324. https://doi.org/10.1177/0969733012462049

Clarivate (2020). EndNote X9. https://endnote.com/contact/

Corley, M. C., Elswick, R. K., Gorman, M., & Clor, T. (2001). Development and evaluation of a moral distress scale. *Journal of Advanced Nursing, 33*(2), 250–256.

Corley, M. C., Minick, P., Elswick, R. K., & Jacobs, M. (2005). Nurse moral distress and ethical work environment. *Nursing Ethics*, *12*(4), 381–390. https://doi.org/10.1191/0969733005ne809oa

DeKeyser Ganz, F., & Berkovitz, K. (2012). Surgical nurses' perceptions of ethical dilemmas, moral distress and quality of care. *Journal of Advanced Nursing, 68*(7), 1516–1525. https://doi.org/ 10.1111/j.1365-2648.2011.05897.x

Deschenes, S., Gagnon, M., Park, T., & Kunyk, D. (2020). Moral distress: A concept clarification. *Nursing Ethics*, 27(4), 1127–1146. https://doi.org/10.1177/0969733020909523

Dryden-Palmer, K., Garros, D., Meyer, E. C., Farrell, C., & Parshuram, C. S. (2018). Care for dying children and their families in the PICU: Promoting clinician education, support, and resilience. *Pediatric Critical Care Medicine/Society of Critical Care Medicine*, *19*(8S), S79–S85. https://doi.org/10.1097/PCC.0000000000001594

Dryden-Palmer, K., Moore, G., McNeil, C., Larson, C. P., Tomlinson, G., Roumeliotis, N., Janvier, A., & Parshuram, C. S. (2020). Moral distress of clinicians in Canadian pediatric and neonatal ICUs. *Pediatric Critical Care Medicine/Society of Critical Care Medicine*, *21*(4), 314–323. https://doi.org/10.1097/PCC.0000000000002189

Epstein, E. G., Haizlip, J., Liaschenko, J., Zhao, D., Bennett, R., & Marshall, M. F. (2020). Moral mistress, mattering, and secondary traumatic stress in provider burnout: A call for moral community. *AACN Advanced Critical Care*, *31*(2), 146–157. https://doi.org/10.4037/aacnacc2020285

Freire, P. (2018). *Pedagogy of the oppressed*. Bloomsbury publishing USA.

Giannetta, N., Villa, G., Pennestrì, F., Sala, R., Mordacci, R., & Manara, D. F. (2020). Instruments to assess moral distress among healthcare workers: A systematic review of measurement properties. *International Journal of Nursing Studies*, 103767. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ijnurstu.2020.103767

Grant, M. J., & Booth, A. (2009). A typology of reviews: An analysis of 14 review types and associated methodologies. *Health Information & Libraries Journal*, 26(2), 91–108. https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1471-1842.2009.00848.x

Hamric, A. B., & Blackhall, L. J. (2007). Nurse-physician perspectives on the care of dying patients in intensive care units: Collaboration, moral distress, and ethical climate. *Critical Care Medicine, 35*(2), 422–429. https://doi.org/10.1080/21507716.2011.652337

Hamric, A. B., Borchers, C. T., & Epstein, E. G. (2012). Development and testing of an instrument to measure moral distress in healthcare professionals. *AJOB Primary Research, 3*(2), 1–9. https://doi.org/10.1080/21507716.2011.652337

Hartling, L., Bond, K., Santaguida, P. L., Viswanathan, M., & Dryden, D. M. (2011). Testing a tool for the classification of study designs in systematic reviews of interventions and exposures showed moderate reliability and low accuracy. *Journal of Clinical Epidemiology*, *64*(8), 861–871. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jclinepi.2011.01.010

Hong, Q. N., Fàbregues, S., Bartlett, G., Boardman, F., Cargo, M., Dagenais, P., Gagnon

M.P., Griffiths, F., Nicolau, B., O'Cathain, A., Rousseau, M.C., Vedel, I. (2018). The mixed methods appraisal tool (MMAT) version 2018 for information professionals and researchers. *Education for Information, 34*(4), 285–291. http://mixedmethodsappraisaltoolpublic.pbworks.com/

Jameton, A. (1984). *Nursing practice: The ethical issues*. Prentice-Hall Incorporated.

Johns, C. (2006). *Engaging reflection in practice: A narrative approach*. Wiley-Blackwell.

Larson, C. P., Dryden-Palmer, K. D., Gibbons, C., & Parshuram, C. S. (2017). Moral distress in PICU and neonatal ICU practitioners: A cross-sectional evaluation. *Pediatric Critical Care Medicine, 18*(8), e318–e326. //dx.doi.org/10.1097/PCC.0000000000001219

Levac, D., Colquhoun, H., & O'Brien, K. K. (2010). Scoping studies: Advancing the methodology. *Implementation Science, 5*(1), 69.

Lützén, K., & Kvist, B. E. (2012). Moral distress: A comparative analysis of theoretical understandings and inter-related concepts. *HEC forum*, 24(1), 13–25. https://doi.org/10.1007/s10730-012-9178-9

Maiden, J., Georges, J. M., & Connelly, C. D. (2011). Moral distress, compassion fatigue, and perceptions about medication errors in certified critical care nurses. *Dimensions of Critical Care Nursing*, *30*(6), 339–345. https://doi.org/10.1097/DCC.0b013e31822fab2a

McCarthy, J., & Deady, R. (2008). Moral distress reconsidered. *Nursing Ethics, 15*(2), 254–262. doi:10.1177/0969733007086023

McCarthy, J., & Gastmans, C. (2015). Moral distress: A review of the argument-based nursing ethics literature. *Nursing Ethics, 22*(1), 131–152. https://doi.org/10.1177/0969733014557139

Merghati Khoiee, E., Vaziri, M.H., Alizadegan, S., Motevallian, S. A., Kashani, O.M.R., Goushegir, S. A., & Ghoroubi, J. (2008). Developing the moral distress scale in the population of Iranian nurses. *Iranian Journal of Psychiatry*, 55–58.

Meziane, D., Ramirez-Garcia, M. P., & Fortin, M. L. (2018). A reflective practice intervention to act on the moral distress of nurses providing end-of-life care on acute care units. *International Journal of Palliative Nursing*, *24*(9), 444–451.

Moher, D., Liberati, A., Tetzlaff, J., & Altman, D. G. (2009). Preferred reporting items for systematic reviews and meta-analyses: The PRISMA statement. *Annals of Internal Medicine, 151*(4), 264–269.

Molazem, Z., Tavakol, N., Sharif, F., Keshavarzi, S., & Ghadakpour, S. (2013). Effect of education based on the "4A Model" on the Iranian nurses' moral distress in CCU wards. *Journal of Medical Ethics and History of Medicine*, *6*.

Morley, G., Bradbury-Jones, C., & Ives, J. (2020). What is 'moral distress' in nursing? A feminist empirical bioethics study. *Nursing Ethics*, *27*(5), 1297–1314. https://doi.org/10.1177/0969733019874492

Morley, G., Ives, J., Bradbury-Jones, C., & Irvine, F. (2019). What is 'moral distress'? A narrative synthesis of the literature. *Nursing Ethics*, *26*(3), 646–662. https://doi.org/10.1177/0969733017724354

Nafchi, S.M., Borhani, F., & Roshanadeh, M. (2015). Relationship between moral distress and environmental empowerment for nurses in education hospitals in Kerman. *Medical Ethics Journal*, *8*(26), 91–113.

Nathaniel, A. K. (2006). Moral reckoning in nursing. *Western Journal of Nursing Research, 28*(4), 419–448. https://doi.org/10.1177/0193945905284727

Pendry, P. S. (2007). Moral distress: Recognizing it to retain nurses. *Nursing Economics, 25*(4), 217–221.

Rushton, C. H. (2016). Moral resilience: a capacity for navigating moral distress in critical care. *AACN Advanced Critical Care*, *27*(1), 111–119. http://dx.doi.org/10.4037/aacnacc2016275

Rushton, C. H., Caldwell, M., & Kurtz, M. (2016). CE: Moral distress: A catalyst in building moral resilience. *The American Journal of Nursing*, *116*(7), 40–49.

Saeedi, S., Jouybari, L., Sanagoo, A., & Vakili, M. A. (2019). The effectiveness of narrative writing on the moral distress of intensive care nurses. *Nursing Ethics*, *26*(7–8), 2195–2203. https://doi.org/10.1177/0969733018806342

Sasso, L., Bagnasco, A., Bianchi, M., Bressan, V., & Carnevale, F. (2016). Moral distress in undergraduate nursing students: A systematic review. *Nursing Ethics, 23*(5), 523–534. https://doi.org/10.1177/0969733015574926

Schick-Makaroff, K., MacDonald, M., Plummer, M., Burgess, J., & Neander, W. (2016). What synthesis methodology should I use? A review and analysis of approaches to research synthesis. *AIMS Public Health, 3*(1), 172. https://doi.org/10.3934/publichealth.2016.1.172

Souto, R. Q., Khanassov, V., Hong, Q. N., Bush, P. L., Vedel, I., & Pluye, P. (2015). Systematic mixed studies reviews: Updating results on the reliability and efficiency of the mixed methods appraisal tool. *International Journal of Nursing Studies*, 52(1), 500–501. http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.ijnurstu.2014.08.010

Vaclavik, E. A., Staffileno, B. A., & Carlson, E. (2018). Moral Distress: Using mindfulness-based stress reduction interventions to decrease nurse perceptions of distress. *Clinical Journal of Oncology Nursing*, *22*(3). https://doi.org/10.1188/18.CJON.326-332

Varcoe, C., Pauly, B., Storch, J., Newton, L., & Makaroff, K. (2012). Nurses' perceptions of and responses to morally distressing situations. *Nursing Ethics, 19*(4), 488-500. https://doi.org/10.1177/0969733011436025

Wall, S., Austin, W. J., & Garros, D. (2016, March). Organizational influences on health professionals' experiences of moral distress in PICUs. *HEC Forum*, 28(1), 53-67. https://doi.org/10.1007/s10730-015-9266-8

Wallis, L. (2015). Moral distress in nursing: coping with this rising concern in health care delivery systems. *AJN Reports* 115(3), 19-20. https://doi.org/10.1097/01.NAJ.0000461804.96483.ba

Watson, J. (2012). *Human caring science: Theory of nursing* (2nd ed.). Jones & Bartlett Publishers.

Whitehead, P. B., Herbertson, R. K., Hamric, A. B., Epstein, E. G., & Fisher, J. M. (2015). Moral distress among healthcare professionals: Report of an institution-wide survey. *Journal of Nursing Scholarship*, *47*(2), 117-125. https://doi.org/10.1111/jnu.12115

Wilkinson, J. M. (1987). Moral distress in nursing practice: Experience and effect. *Nursing Forum, 23*(1), 16-29. https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1744-6198.1987.tb00794.x

Wocial, L. D., & Weaver, M. T. (2013). Development and psychometric testing of a new tool for detecting moral distress: The moral distress thermometer. *Journal of Advanced Nursing, 69*(1), 167-174. https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1365-2648.2012.06036.x

Wocial, L., Ackerman, V., Leland, B., Benneyworth, B., Patel, V., Tong, Y., & Nitu, M. (2017). Pediatric ethics and communication excellence (PEACE) rounds: Decreasing moral distress and patient length of stay in the PICU. *HEC Forum, 29*(1), 75-91. https://doi.org/10.1007/s10730-016-9313-0